

The Influence of the Translation Process on Narrative Facts in the Kawabata Yasunari's Novel *Yukiguni* and Two Indonesian-language Translations

WIASTININGSIH

日本語・インドネシア語の翻訳研究：

—川端康成『雪国』のストーリー要素と2つのインドネシア語の翻訳版—

ウィアスティニンシー

要 旨

文学作品は社会の価値を反映する。エイブラムス(1981:178)によると、文学は社会の生活を反映している。インドネシア文学を研究しているオランダ人であるテーウ(1984:100)によれば、文学作品は言語的、文化的、文学的なルールを参照して書かれている。しかしながら、文学作品の翻訳の中には原作と翻訳それぞれこれらの三つの要素が異なっているため、幾つかの問題が生じる。例えば、日本文学では「季語」がよく使用されている。日本人の読者であれば、時間の設定がはっきり書かれていなくても、季語から理解できる。しかし、この季語は読者の文化にない場合は、季語を簡単に理解できない。作品が翻訳されるということは、作品の言語が異なる言語に変換されるというだけではなく、作品が異なるルールをもつ社会の中に持ち込まれるという点が重要である。

したがって、翻訳者は2つの社会(Source LanguageとTarget Language)のルールを十分に理解したうえで翻訳をする必要がある。しかし、このことは現実には大変に困難である。なぜなら、2つの異なる社会に同時に native であることは、native の定義上、困難だから。

本稿では、川端康成原作『雪国』の2つのインドネシア語訳、1972年刊行のNegeri Salju(重訳)と1985年刊行のDaerah Salju(共訳型の直訳)を取り上げる。本稿では文学の視点から、翻訳のプロセスはどのようにストーリー要素に影響を及ぼすのかを明らかにしようと試みる。具体的には、プロットと登場人物描写と背景というストーリーの要素を分析する。

本稿の分析から、小説の翻訳は話の要素に影響をもたらしたことが明らかになった。まず、登場人物の描写が逆の意味になったり、年齢に関する訳が一年間違ったりした。次に場所が違ったり、時間の言い方も違ったりした。さらに、メインプロットは同じであるが、形式の分け方が違って来たことが明らかになった。直訳にも重訳にも様々な問題が生じる。重訳では英語版に頼って訳されたので、英語版で誤訳があれば、同じく誤訳になってしまう。

ストーリー要素は物語を解釈する手段として重要である。よって、上記のようにストーリー要素が間違っただけで翻訳されると、小説の解釈にも影響を与え得るであろう。日本語からインドネシア語に小説を翻訳する時には、解決方法として、重訳であってもかまわないのでインドネシア語への翻訳や、英語などの第三の言語への翻訳がすでにあるのであれば、それを参照しつつ、直訳することが適切であり、かつ、その場合でも、インドネシア語に習熟した日本人の協力を得ることが適切である。

キーワード：直訳、重訳、ストーリー要素の解釈



Abstract

Literary works reflect the value of society. According to Abrams (1981: 178), literature reflects social life. According to Teeuw (1984: 100), Dutch researcher of Indonesian literature, literary works are written with reference to linguistic, cultural and literary conventions. However, there are some problems when it comes to the translation of literary works, because these three elements of the original works in source language and their translation into the target language are different. Translating a certain literary work does not only mean translating the language of the work into another language, but it also means bringing the work into another society of different conventions.

Therefore, translators need to fully understand the conventions of the two societies (Source Language Society and Target Language Society) before translating a literary work. However, in reality this is very difficult work to do. It is because, by definition, it is very difficult to be a native of 2 different societies at the same time.

This paper analyzed two Indonesian translations of *Yukiguni* written by Yasunari Kawabata, *Negeri Salju* as an example of indirect translation, published in 1972 and *Daerah Salju*, published in 1985, as an example of direct translation. In translating the Daerah Salju, there is possibility that the translators referred to *Negeri Salju*, even though it is an indirect translation because it was published earlier and to Seidensticker's translation which is the English version—the source text—of *Negeri Salju*. Thus, it will be effective for translating *Daerah Salju* more accurately.

In this, I analyzed the two translations using a literary point of view, and show how the translation process affects the elements of the story. Firstly, there are opposite descriptions of characters, different translation of age-related number and different description of time and place. Secondly, although the main plot remains the same, there are different plot divisions.

There are various problems occurring in both direct translation and indirect translation. The indirect translation relies solely on the English version, so if there is mistranslation in the English version, the translation also will be wrong.

Elements of the story are important in interpreting stories. Therefore, if the elements of the story are translated incorrectly, as described above, the interpretation of the novel will be affected. In conclusion, the most effective way in translating Japanese literary works into Indonesian is by collaboration between a Japanese who is fluent in Indonesian language and an Indonesian translator, while also taking into consideration the previous translation works whenever available.

Keywords: direct translation, indirect translation, interpretation of element of story

Tables of Contents

Abstract in Japanese

Abstract in English

Title

I. Introduction

II. Theoretical Framework

III. Analysis

3.1 Characters and Characterization

3.2 Plot

3.3 Setting

IV. Conclusion and Recommendation

References

I. Introduction

Literature reflects social and cultural facts. Literary works reflect the value of society. According to Abrams (1981: 178), literature reflects social life. According to Teeuw (1984, p. 100), Dutch researcher of Indonesian literature, literary works are written with reference to linguistic, cultural and literary conventions. However, there are some problems when it comes to the translation of literary works, because these three elements of the original works in source language and their translation into the target language are different. For example, “Haiku” as one of the unique Japanese literary works has a rule of making it with 5-7-5 sounds. It is difficult to produce 5-7-5 sounds in the same way if a *haiku* with such rules is translated into a foreign language. In addition, “seasonal word” is often used in the Japanese literature world. For example, “persimmon” is used as a seasonal word for the autumn season and “cherry blossom viewing” is used as a seasonal word for the spring season. Japanese people who read Japanese literary works can understand the time setting from the seasonal word, even if the time setting is not written explicitly. However, when the seasonal word is translated into a foreign language, the readers cannot easily understand the time setting of the story unless the readers know about Japanese culture and the role of seasonal word. In other words, translating a certain literary work does not only mean translating the language of the work into another language, but it also means bringing the work into another society of different conventions.

Therefore, translators need to fully understand the conventions of the two societies (Source Language Society and Target Language Society) before translating a literary work. However, in reality this is very difficult work to do. It is because, by definition, very difficult to be a native of two different societies at the same time.

Commonly, translators translate the learned language as the source language into their native language as the target language. It is because their native language proficiency is naturally much better than their learned language proficiency. Translation works must be written in a not unnatural text for the readers of the target language. Therefore, considering the relationship between source language and target language in translation, generally the most reasonable strategy is: to translate literary works from learned language into native language.

However, in any society, there is no language education system that can increase learners’ skill of all the languages into a level where they can fully translate from and into the language they learn. For example, in Indonesia, Japanese language lesson is insufficient compared to English lesson. In Indonesia, everyone must study English from junior high school or even some from elementary school, but Japanese is not compulsory. For this reason, translators who can translate directly from English as the source language to Indonesian as the target language are more well trained compared to translators who can translate directly from Japanese as the source language into Indonesian as the target language.

In Indonesia, two strategies have been taken to address this issue. One is an indirect translation; translating an English version of Japanese works into Indonesian. Although it is a realistic strategy, the accuracy of the indirect translation can not be guaranteed. The other strategy is a direct translation, through collaboration between a Japanese who is fluent in Indonesian and Indonesian translator.

This paper presents an examples of the above two strategies. Two Indonesian translations of *Yukiguni* written by Yasunari Kawabata, *Negeri Salju* as an indirect translation, published in 1972 and *Daerah Salju*, published in 1985, as a direct translation. The reason why I choose this novel is because this novel was translated in two method, direct translation and also indirect translation. In translating the *Daerah Salju*, there is possibility that the translators referred to *Negeri Salju*, even though it is an indirect translation because it was published earlier and to Seidensticker’s translation which is the English

version --the source text-- of Negeri Salju. Thus, it will be effective for translating *Daerah Salju* more accurately. In this article, I analyzed the two translations using a literary point of view, and show how the translation process affects the elements of the story.

II. Theoretical Framework

For this article, narrative facts are defined in accordance with the theory formulated by Roberts Stanton in his book, *An Introduction to Fiction*, published by Holt Rinehart and Winston in 1965.

Stanton (1965, p. 3) states that a good serious fiction is self-explanatory in that it can be enjoyed by later generations. Most popular fictions more than forty years old seem quaint and incomprehensible today—just as present-day popular fictions will seem forty years from now—because it is based upon character types and situations that are no longer familiar. However, a good serious fiction remains fresh, because it only requires that the reader be familiar with ordinary human experience and the language used (Stanton 1965, p. 3). A serious fiction is difficult and challenging partly because it builds a complex structure of details around a central purpose or idea. Most serious fictions demand careful reading—and careful rereading.

Yukiguni is one of a Japanese novel which still can be enjoyed today so it can be called as one of good serious fiction as defined by Robert Stanton above and demands careful reading and careful rereading. The novel *Yukiguni* was written by Kawabata Yasunari and published as a serial between 1935 and 1937. The novel was finished in 1937 and published in its entirety that year (Seidensticker 1984, p. vii). Even today, the novel remains appreciated in Japan, as seen in its repeated reissues and frequent translations, as well as its adaptation to drama, film, and comic. This appreciation of the novel *Yukiguni* indicates that it is still enjoyed by readers of different eras and even different cultures. As such, following Stanton's formulation above, *Yukiguni* can be categorized as a serious novel, one that requires careful reading and rereading.

Stanton (1965, pp. 11–12) identifies several specific terms and methods used in the reading and discussion of serious fiction. These topics are grouped under three main headings: narrative facts, theme, and literary devices. Narrative facts are characters, plot, and setting. Those elements belong to the story as a record of imaginable occurrences. Taken together, these elements are sometimes called the “factual structure” or “factual level” of the story. A story's factual structure is simply one way in which its details are organized; these same details are also organized to form patterns that convey the theme (Stanton, 1965, pp. 11–12). For the first step of research, this article only will analyze the narrative facts because as Stanton said narrative facts belong to the story as a record of imaginable occurrences. As a record of imaginable occurrences, narrative facts can be analyzed based on evidence that are written in the novel.

The plot of a story is its entire sequence of events. The term is usually limited, however, to include only casually linked events, that is, events that directly cause or result from other events and cannot be omitted without breaking the line of action. These events may include not only physical occurrences, like speech or action, but also characters' changes of attitude, flashes of insight, decisions—anything that alters the course of affairs. Subplots are sequences of events at least partly distinct from the main plot. The plot is the backbone of a story. Two important elements of plot are conflict and climax. Every work of fiction contains obvious internal conflict between two desires within a character, external conflict between characters, or between a character and his environment (Stanton 1965, pp. 14-16).

The term “character” is commonly used in two ways: to designate the individuals who appear in the story, and to refer to

the mixture of interests, desires, motion, and moral principles that makes up such individuals. Most stories contain a central character who is relevant to every event in the story (Stanton 1965, p. 17).

The setting of a story is the environment of its events, the immediate world in which the events occur. Part of the setting is the visible background, such as a café or mountain; part of it may also be the time of day or year, the climate, the historical period (Stanton 1965, p. 18).

In this research, emphasis will be given to the translation process's influence on three narrative facts: characters and characterization, setting (time and place), and plot. The data presented here comes from one novel, three editions. First is Kawabata Yasunari's novel *Yukiguni*, published in the book *Nihon no Bungaku 38* published by Chūōkōronsha in 1965. Second, the novel *Negeri Salju*, translated into Indonesian from the novel *Yukiguni* by Anas Ma'ruf and published by Pustaka Jaya in 1972. Third is the novel *Daerah Salju*, translated into Indonesian from the novel *Yukiguni* by Ajip Rosidi and Matsuoka Kunio and published by Pustaka Jaya in 1985.

III. Analysis

This analysis will be divided into three sections, respectively exploring the characters and characterization, setting, and plot. All data in the analysis presented as below: 'a' is the Japanese version, *Yukiguni*, written by Kawabata Yasunari, 'b' is the indirect translation version, *Negeri Salju*, translated by Anas Ma'ruf, and 'c' is the direct translation version, *Daerah Salju*, translated by Ajip Rosidi and Matsuoka Kunio. After each sentence of the Indonesian direct translation and Indonesian indirect translation English translation is given to make easier for the reader who does not know Indonesian to understand the meaning of the sentence. These English translations are mine and not taken from the English version translated by Seidensticker. And the quotation of English version translated by Seidensticker will be mentioned clearly before the quotation.

Data samples presented in this article chosen based on the need of every analysis and the accuracy of the data which can be compared one another.

1. Characters and Characterization

A synopsis of the novel *Yukiguni* will be presented here to ease readers' understanding of the analysis contained herein. The novel tells of the second trip made by a man named Shimamura to a snowy region to meet Komako, a geisha whom he has met previously. Shimamura rides the same train as a young woman named Yōko, who is also travelling to the snowy land. Shimamura is spellbound by Yōko's beauty. After arriving at his inn, where he stays for several days, Komako often visits him. One day, Komako sends Yōko to deliver a message to Shimamura, who takes the opportunity to speak with her. Yōko asks to be brought to Tokyo. At the end of the story, the 'theatre house' where Yōko watches a film is destroyed in a fire; Yōko, too, dies in the flames.

The characters in *Yukiguni* are Shimamura, Komako, Yōko, Yōko's brother, the Station Chief, Kimiko, Kikuyu, and the masseuse. The influence of the translation process on the novel's characterization is explored below:

① Shimamura

Shimamura is described as having an unspecified job, though he also writes essays and literature. Although he is married, with his wife living in Tokyo, he has a special relationship with another woman: Komako. More detailed characterization is presented below.

- 1.a 鳥村は退屈まぎれに左手の人差指をいろいろに動かして眺めて、結局この指だけが、これから会いに行く女をなまなましく覚えている… (Kawabata 1965, p. 8). Shimamura wa taikutsu magireni hidari te no hitosashiyubi wo iro-iro ni ugokashitenagamete, kekkyoku kono yubi dake ga, korekara ai ni iku onna o namanamashiku oboete iru,...
- 1.b Dalam kebosanannya, Shimamura menatap tangan kirinya seakan-akan telunjuknya bengkok. Hanya tangan ini nampaknya mempunyai kenangan yang penting dan langsung tentang wanita yang akan dikunjunginya (In his boredom, Shimamura gazed at his left hand as if his little finger was bent. Only this hand appeared to hold important, direct memories of the woman he was visiting) (*Negeri Salju*, Ma'ruf 1972, p. 13).
- 1.c (Tiga jam yang lalu) sambil melihat jari telunjuk tangan kiri yang digerak-gerakkannya dengan berbagai cara lantaran iseng, Shimamura merasa ganjil memikirkan bahwa akhirnya hanya jari itu sajalah yang masih mengingatkannya dengan hangat akan wanita yang beberapa jenak lagi akan ditemuinya,.... ([Three hours earlier] while looking at the little finger of his left hand, which he was moving about aimlessly, Shimamura felt it odd to realize that only this finger still reminded him of the warmth of the woman with whom he would meet in moments) (*Daerah Salju*, Rosidi 1985, p. 23).

From the above description, it can be understood that Shimamura had previously met with the woman with whom he was meeting during this trip. His memories of the woman he met were stored in the little finger with which he had touched her. Although all three of these quotations describe the same memories of this woman, all present different descriptions of Shimamura's finger. In *Negeri Salju*, 「鳥村は退屈まぎれに左手の人差指をいろいろに動かして眺めて」 (*Shimamura wa taikutsu magireni hidari te no hitosashiyubi o iro-iro ni ugokashitenagamete*) is translated *Shimamura menatap tangan kirinya seakan-akan telunjuknya bengkok* (Shimamura gazed at his left hand as if his little finger was bent). In *Daerah Salju*, this sentence is translated *sambil melihat jari telunjuk tangan kiri yang digerak-gerakkannya dengan berbagai cara lantaran iseng* (while looking at the little finger of his left hand, which he was moving about aimlessly). In Indonesian, the phrase *seakan-akan telunjuknya bengkok* means that Shimamura's finger has been bent or previously deformed. In the source text, this finger can be understood as being connected to the woman whom Shimamura intends to visit. During his previous meeting with the woman, Shimamura had touched her, and as such his finger stored his memories of the woman. As such, during his trip he moves his finger to better remember how he had touched the woman. From this, it can be understood that Shimamura's finger is not deformed, but rather being consciously moved so that he can better remember the woman he had met. This description of Shimamura moving his finger is changed in *Negeri Salju* to show Shimamura's finger as deformed.

In a later passage, Shimamura explains the type of woman he desires, as follows.

2.a 「きれいって言ったて。」 (駒子)

「若いのがいいね。若い方がなにかにつけてまちがいが少いだろう。うるさくしゃべれんのがいい。ほ

んやりしていて、よごれていないのが。しゃべりたい時は君としゃべるよ。」(島村)(Kawabata 1965, p. 15)

「Kireitte ittate」(Komako)

「Wakai no ga ii ne. Wakai hō ga nanika ni tsukete machigai ga sukunai darō. Urusaku shaberen no ga ii. Bonyari shite ite, yogorete inai noga. Shaberitai toki wa kimi to shaberuyo.」

(Shimamura) (Kawabata 1965, p. 15)

2.b “Apa yang Anda anggap kelihatan baik?” (“What do you think looks good?”, Komako)

“Seseorang yang muda. Engkau kurang cocok untuk berbuat kesalahan bila mereka muda. Dan seseorang yang tidak terlalu banyak bicara. Bersih, dan tidak terlalu cepat. Bilamana saya ingin seseorang untuk kawan bicara, saya dapat berbicara denganmu.” (“You’re young. You aren’t right to make mistakes when young. And someone who doesn’t talk much. Clean, not too fast... if I want someone to speak with, I can talk to you”, Shimamura) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 25)

2.c “Cantik bagaimana yang Tuan maksudkan?” (“Beautiful? What do you mean, Sir?”, Komako)

“Aku suka yang muda. Yang muda barangkali lebih sedikit kekurangannya. Lebih baik yang tidak banyak omong. Bukan yang cerdas dan bukan yang jorok. Kalau aku cari kawan bicara, kaulah orangnya.” (“I like the young ones. The young ones, perhaps, have fewer shortcomings. It’s better to not talk much. Not clever, not disgusting. If I’m looking for a friend to talk to, you’re the person”, Shimamura) (Rosidi 1985, p. 39)

In *Negeri Salju*, the sentence 「若い方がなにかにつけてまちがいが少いだらう。」(*Wakai hō ga nanika ni tsukete machigai ga sukunai darō*) is translated *Engkau kurang cocok untuk berbuat kesalahan bila mereka muda* (You aren’t right to make mistakes if they are young), while in *Daerah Salju* it is translated *Yang muda barangkali lebih sedikit kekurangannya* (The young ones, perhaps, have fewer shortcomings). In *Negeri Salju*, the translation uses the word *Engkau* (you), and as such the sentence becomes a descriptive one referring to Komako as Shimamura’s conversation partner. However, the sentence is intended to establish the characteristics Shimamura desires in a woman and to ask Komako to find such a woman. It can thus be concluded that the translation *Daerah Salju* more closely follows the source text, as it is a description of the type of woman desired by Shimamura, while the translation *Negeri Salju* presents Komako as Shimamura’s conversation partner.

Shimamura is further described as often writing about Western dance, as shown in the following quotations:

3.a 西洋の印刷物を頼りに西洋舞踊について書くほど安楽はなかった (Kawabata 1965, p. 17)

Seiyō no insatsubutsu o tayori ni seiyō buyō ni tsuite kaku hodo anraku wa nakatta.

3.b Tidak ada yang lebih menyenangkan daripada menulis tentang balet dari buku-buku (There is nothing more pleasant than writing about ballet based on books) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 27).

3.c Tidak ada yang lebih mudah daripada menulis tentang tarian Barat berdasarkan tulisan-tulisan yang diterbitkan di negeri-negeri Barat sendiri (There is nothing easier than writing about Western dance based on the writings published in the Western countries themselves) (Rosidi 1985, p. 43)

Because in the source text it is written 「西洋の印刷物を頼りに」(*Seiyō no insatsubutsu o tayori*), which means to write

based on articles published in the West, it can be surmised that Shimamura is fluent in at least one language used in the West. Meanwhile, because in *Negeri Salju* this phrase is translated *dari buku-buku* (from books), it is unclear whether the books are in Japanese or a foreign language. As such, Shimamura's implied command of a foreign language and interaction with foreign cultures is not conveyed in the translation *Negeri Salju*.

Shimamura is depicted as having an unspecified job, though he sometimes writes about Western dance. This can be seen in the following quotes.

- 4.a しかも、時々西洋舞踊の紹介など書くので文筆家の端くれに数えられ、それを自ら冷笑しながら職業のない彼の心休めとなることもあるのだった (Kawabata 1965, p. 17)
Shikamo, tokidoki seiyō buyō no shōkai nado kaku node bunpitsuka no hashikure ni kazoerare, sore o mizukara seserawarai shinagara shokugyō no nai kare no kokoro yasume to naru koto mo aru no datta.
- 4.b Tetapi juga benar bahwa Shimamura tanpa jabatan yang nyata, peroleh sesuatu kepuasan dari kenyataan bahwa pengenalan sekali-sekali terhadap tari Barat mendorongnya ke tepi dunia kesusastraan juga selagi dia menertawakan dirinya sendiri dan karyanya (But though it was true that Shimamura had no real position, he found satisfaction of sorts in the fact that his occasional introductions to Western dance had pushed him to the fringes of the literary world, and he laughed at himself and his work) (Ma'ruf 1972, p. 28).
- 4.c Karena dia kadang-kadang menulis karangan untuk memperkenalkan tarian Barat, maka dia dianggap juga sebagai seorang pengarang, dan hal itu dapat menghibur dirinya yang tidak mempunyai pekerjaan tetap walaupun ia sendiri menertawakan hal itu (Because he sometimes wrote articles to introduce Western dance, he was considered a writer, and this gave him some entertainment in the face of having no fixed job, even though he laughed at it himself) (Rosidi 1985, p. 43-44).

In the source text, Shimamura is said to be considered a writer because he sometimes wrote articles about Western dance. In the *Negeri Salju* translation, the sentence 「時々西洋舞踊の紹介など書くので文筆家の端くれに数えられ」 (*tokidoki seiyō buyō no shōkai nado kaku node bunpitsuka no hashikure ni kazoerare*) is translated *pengenalan sekali-sekali terhadap tari Barat mendorongnya ke tepi dunia kesusastraan* (his occasional introductions to Western dance had pushed him to the fringes of the literary world). From this translation, it can be understood that Shimamura has become interested in literature because of his introduction of Western dance through his writing. 「心休め」 (*kokoro yasume*) is translated *beroleh suatu kepuasan* (found satisfaction of sorts), so it can be understood that Shimamura is satisfied although having no specific job, and he is interested in the world of literature because of his writing about Western dance. The word *kepuasan* (satisfaction) deviates from the meaning of the source text; 心休め refers to the temporary shedding of anxiety and fear. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* 「時々西洋舞踊の紹介など書くので文筆家の端くれに数えられ」 is translated *karena dia kadang kadang menulis karangan untuk memperkenalkan tarian Barat, maka dia dianggap juga sebagai seorang pengarang* (Because he sometimes wrote articles to introduce Western dance, he was considered a writer). From this translation, the reader can understand that Shimamura's writing about Western dance has led to him being considered a writer. The word 「それを自ら冷笑しながら」 is translated *ia sendiri menertawakan hal itu* (he laughed at it himself), which implies that he has a poor opinion of himself. This is antonymous to *Negeri Salju*, where he is said to find satisfaction. Based on the analysis, it is clear that Shimamura's characterization is different in the source novel and in the indirect translation *Negeri Salju*.

Based on the above analysis, characterization of Shimamura in the direct translation and indirect translation not only differs in the physical description, such as Shimamura's hand is deformed in indirect translation, but also differs in the description of the way of thinking, such as how he thinks about himself without any specific job.

② Yōko

Yōko is described as having known the station chief in the snowy area where the story is set. At the beginning of the novel, it is told that Yōko was returning home to the snowy region with an ill young man under her protection. Shimamura observed Yōko because they rode the same train.

- 5.a 「駅長さん、私です。御機嫌よろしゅうございます。」(葉子)
「ああ、葉子さんじゃないか。お帰りかい。また寒くなったよ。」(駅長) (Kawabata 1965, p. 7)
Ekichōsan, watashi desu. Gokigen yoroshū gozaimasu. (Yōko)
Aa, Yōko san janaika. Okaerikai. Mata samuku natta yo. (Ekicho)
- 5.b “Apa kabar?” seru gadis itu. “Saya Yōko” (“How are you?”, said the girl. “I’m Yōko.” (Yōko)
“Yōkokah itu. Mau pulang? Hari jadi dingin lagi.” (Is that Yōko. Are you heading home? The days are getting colder (Station chief) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 11)
- 5.c “Pak Sep, ini saya. Apa kabar?” (Mister Station chief, it’s me. How are you?”, Yōko)
“Ah, Yōko-san! Mau pulang? Sudah dingin lagi.” (Ah, Yōko-san! Are you heading home? It’s cold again. (Station chief) (Rosidi 1985, p. 20)

In these three versions of the text—the source text and the two translations—it is shown that Yōko is familiar with the station chief in the snowy region. The reader can understand this because 「お帰りかい」(*okaerikai*), meaning ‘Are you heading home?’, is translated in accordance with the source text. As such, Yōko is shown as originating from the snowy region and as returning from a trip.

The following description shows how Yōko is riding a train with an ill young man and protecting him:

- 6.a 娘は胸をこころもち傾けて、前に横たわった男を一心に見下していた (Kawabata 1965, p. 9)
Musume wa mune o kokoromochi katamukete, mae ni yokotawatta otoko o isshin ni mioroshite ita.
- 6.b Gadis itu membungkuk dengan kentara ke depan, meremehkan lelaki di depannya (The girl was bowing, leaning noticeably forward, mocking the man in front of her.) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 14).
- 6.c Gadis itu duduk dengan dada agak condong dan tetap memandang pada laki-laki yang berbaring di depannya (The girl was sitting, her chest pushed a little forward, and she continued looking upon the man before her) (Rosidi 1985, p. 24).

In *Negeri Salju*, 「見下していた」(*mioroshite ita*) is translated as *meremehkan*, which means ‘to show disdain’, ‘to put down’, or ‘to ignore’. This meaning deviates greatly from that of the original text, which refers to physically looking down. This has occurred because 「見下していた」 can be read *mikudashite ita*, which means to show disdain, or it can be read *mioroshite ita*, which means to physically look down. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* the word 「見下していた」 is translated

‘continued looking’. As such, the reader can understand that Yōko is diligently taking care of an ill person and that Yōko is a kind person. This characterization is directly opposed to that in *Negeri Salju*.

Elsewhere, it is written that Yōko hails from the snowy region that Shimamura is visiting:

- 7.a 駅長と知り合いらしい昨夜の話しぶりでも、この山袴でも、葉子がかこあたりの娘のことは明らかだが、派手な帯が半ば山袴の上に出ているので、山袴の薄色と黒とのあらい木綿縞はあざやかに引き立ち、めりんすの長い袂も同じわけでなまめかしかった。山袴のまたは膝の少し上で割れているから、ゆっくり膨らんで見え、しかも硬い木綿が引きしまって見え、なにか安らかであった (Kawabata 1965, p. 31)
Ekichō to shiriai rashii sakuya no hanashi buri demo, kono sanpaku demo, Yōko ga koko atari no musume no koto wa akiraka daga, hade na obi ga nakaba sanpaku no ue ni dete iru node, sanpaku no usuiro to kuro to no arai momenjima wa azayaka ni hikitachi, merinsu no nagai tamoto mo onaji wake de namameshikatatta. Sanpaku no matawa hiza no sukoshi ue de warete irukara, yukkuri fukurande mie, shikamo katai momen ga hikishimatte mie, nanika yasuraka deatta.
- 7.b Jelas, dari caranya yang ramah, ketika ia berbicara dengan kepala stasion malam sebelumnya dan dari cara ia memakai “celana gunung”, niscaya ia anak negeri salju ini, tetapi pola gundul obinya, separoh kelihatan di atas celana, membuat garis-garis yang kemerah-merahan dan hitam celana nampaknya segar dan meriah, dan dengan alasan yang sama lengan panjang kimono wolnya menampilkan keindahan tertentu yang menyenangkan. Celana, bersibak tepat di bawah lutut, menutup ke arah panggul, dan katun yang berat itu, mengingatkan kekakuan sifatnya, agak lentuk dan santun (It was clear, from her friendly approach when she was speaking with the station chief the night before, and from the way she wore “mountain pants”, that she was a daughter of this snowy land, but the pattern of her bald *obi*, half visible above her pants, made the reddish and black lines of her pants appear fresh and joyous, and for the same reason the long sleeves of her wool *kimono* showed a certain pleasing beauty. Her pants, parted directly below the knee, covered back to her hips, and this heavy cotton, reminiscent of her stiff attitude, was somewhat supple and polite, Ma’ruf 1972, pp. 52–53).
- 7.c Dari cara bicarannya dengan kepala stasiun yang rupanya sudah di kenal, juga dari *sanpaku* yang dia pakai, jelaslah bahwa Yōko gadis dari daerah ini, tapi karena setengah dari *obinya* yang mewah kelihatan di atas *sanpaku*, maka corak *sanpaku* yang terbuat dari kain katun berupa garis-garis jarang berwarna kuning kemerahan dengan hitam sangat menyolok, dan begitu juga *tamoto* panjang dari baju kain wol tipis terasa merangsang berahi. Karena *sanpaku* terbelah sedikit di atas lutut maka kelihatan agak mengembung, namun demikian kain katun yang tebal dan kaku menyebabkannya nampak ketat, sehingga menentramkan (From her way of speaking with the station chief, whom she appeared to know, as well as the *sanpaku* she was wearing, it was clear that Yōko was a daughter of this region, but because half of her luxurious *obi* was visible above her *sanpaku*, the pattern of the *sanpaku* that was made of cotton and stripes of reddish yellow and black stuck out, and the long *tamoto* made of thin wool stirred the lust. Because her *sanpaku* was split a bit above the knee, it appeared to be billowing, but the thick and stiff cotton made it look tight, and reassuring, Rosidi 1985, p. 78-79).

Although all three of these versions describe Yōko as being originally from the snowy land, their depictions of the clothing worn by Yōko differ. In *Negeri Salju* 「派手な帯」 (*hade na obi*) is translated *pola gundul obinya* (pattern of her

bald obi). Because *gundul* in Indonesian means having no hair (of a head), having no fur (of an animal); having no plants (of an area, land); having no leaves (of a tree), this gives the impression that the *obi* (sash) is plain and simple. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, 「派手な帯は」 is translated *obinya yang mewah* (her luxurious obi). This reference to a luxurious *obi* is antonymous to the translation in *Negeri Salju*. Meanwhile, the word 派手 means ‘conspicuous’ or drawing attention. As such, the two descriptions in these translations are incapable of accurately conveying the meaning of the source text. The translation of 「なまめかしかった」 (*namamekashikatta*), which means curvaceous and arousing, is likewise different. In *Negeri Salju*, it is translated *menampilkan keindahan tertentu yang menyenangkan* (showed a certain pleasing beauty), which refers to beauty but lacks the connotation of sexual attraction. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, it is translated *merangsang berahi* (stirred the lust), which explicitly reveals this eroticism.

Later, it is written how Yōko accepts Shimamura’s offer to take her to Tokyo when she first speaks to him:

8.a 「それじゃ、帰る時連れて行ってあげようか。」(島村)

「ええ、連れて帰ってください。」と、こともなげに、しかし真剣な声で言うので、島村は驚いた。(葉子)

.....

「君は東京でさしずめ落ち着く先きとか、なにをしたいとかいうことくらいきまっていないと危ないじゃないか。(島村) (Kawabata 1965, p. 69-70)

「Soreja, kaeru toki tsurete itte ageyōka」(Shimamura)

「Ee, tsurete kaette kudasai」kotomonageni, shikashi shinken na koe de iu node, Shimamura wa odoroiita. (Yōko)

.....

「Kimi wa Tokyo de sashizume ochitsuku saki toka, nani wo shitai toka iu koto kurai kimatte inai to abunai janaika」(Shimamura)

8.b “Akan saya bawa anda ke Tokyo bila saya kembali?” (Should I take you to Tokyo if I return?, Shimamura)

“Silahkan.” Kesungguhan itu mesra sekaligus nadanya menunjukkan bahwa soal itu tidak penting, pendeknya. Shimamura terkejut. (“Please.” (Yōko) The sincerity was intimate, while the short tone suggested it wasn’t important. Shimamura was surprised)

.....

“Nampaknya tidak berbahaya pergi ke Tokyo sekurang-kurangnya tanpa memutuskan dimana engkau akan tinggal dan apa yang mungkin engkau lakukan?” (“It doesn’t appear to be too dangerous to go to Tokyo, at least without deciding where you will stay and what you will do?”, Shimamura) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 117)

8.c “Kalau begitu bagaimana kalau aku membawamu waktu pulang?” (“If that’s the case, why don’t I take you home?”, Shimamura)

“Ya, saya mau Tuan bawa,” katanya acuh tak acuh tetapi dengan suara yang bersungguh-sungguh sehingga Shimamura terkejut. (“Yes, I would like you to take me,” (Yōko) she said, apathetically but with a voice that was so sincere that Shimamura was surprised)

.....

“Bukankah itu berbahaya kalau tidak ada tempat untuk engkau tinggal di Tokyo, atau belum pasti apa yang hendak kau kerjakan. (“Isn’t it dangerous if there is no place for you to live in Tokyo, or if you’re not sure what you will do?” Rosidi 1985, p. 173).

In the source text and in both translations, Yōko is described as wanting to accompany Shimamura to Tokyo. However, there are differences in Shimamura's recommendation to Yōko. The source text and *Daerah Salju* have the same meaning: Shimamura considers it dangerous. However, in *Negeri Salju*, the phrase 「危ないじゃないか」 (*abunai janaika*) is translated *Nampaknya tidak berbahaya* (It doesn't appear to be too dangerous), giving it a meaning opposed to that of the source text. This translation occurred based to the English version "It doesn't seem dangerous to go to Tokyo without at least deciding where you will stay or what you might want to do? (Seidensticker, 1996, p. 136)." This means that it is not dangerous for Yōko to travel to Tokyo with Shimamura without any place to stay or clear goal. Because of the different depictions of Shimamura's reaction to Yōko's desire leads to different characterizations of her. In *Negeri Salju*, it is written that, because Yōko wants to go to Tokyo, she has not thought of her destination in Tokyo or the risks she must face. As such, she appears careless, a characterization that goes against the source text.

Based on the analysis, both in direct translation and indirect translation, Yōko described that she is familiar with the station chief in the snowy region but other characterization are opposite one another.

③ Yōko's Brother

Yōko's brother is described as working at the same train station as the station chief that Yōko greets upon returning from Tokyo.

9.a 「ほんのこどもですから、駅長さんからよく教えてやっていただいて、よろしく願いいたしますわ。」
(葉子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 7)

「Hon no kodomo desukara, ekichō san kara yoku oshiete yatte itadaite, yoroshiku onegai itashimasu wa.」 (Yōko)

9.b “Dia sebenarnya bukan anak-anak lagi. Sudilah kiranya Tuan mengajarkan apa yang diperlukan (He actually isn't a child anymore. Do you think, Sir, that you could teach him what he needs?” (Yōko); Ma'ruf 1972, pp. 11–12)

9.c “Ia masih anak-anak, jadi saya mohon Bapak sudi membimbingnya baik-baik. Tolong” (“He is still a child, so I ask you, Sir, to guide him well. Please” (Yōko); Rosidi 1985, p. 20)

In all three versions, Yōko requests that the station chief guide her brother. However, there are differences in the description of him. In *Negeri Salju*, the phrase 「ほんのこどもです」 (*hon no kodomo desu*) is translated *bukan anak-anak lagi* (isn't a child anymore). This gives the impression that Yōko's brother is an adult. This description differs from that of the source text. In *Daerah Salju*, this phrase is translated *masih anak-anak* (still a child), which has the same meaning as the source text. As such, the sentence indicates to the reader that Yōko's brother still requires guidance because he is not yet an adult.

Furthermore, Yōko asks the station chief whether her brother drinks sake:

10.a 「弟もお酒をいただきますでしょうか。」 (葉子)

「いや。」 (駅長) (Kawabata 1965, p. 7)

「Otōto mo osake wo itadakimasu deshōka.」

「Iya.」

10.b “Minumkah adik saya?” (Does my brother drink?)

“Tidak tahu saya.” (I don’t know, Ma’ruf 1972, p. 12)

10.c “Adik saya juga minum sake?” (Does my brother also drink sake?) (Yōko)

“Tidak.” (No, Rosidi 1985, p. 20)

In *Negeri Salju*, because the word 「いや」 (*iya*) is translated *Saya tidak tahu* (I don’t know), the station chief is shown as not being certain whether Yōko’s brother drinks sake or not. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, it is translated *Tidak* (No), and thus indicates that the station chief is certain that Yōko’s brother does not drink sake. Although, based on its intonation, the word 「いや」 can be considered accurate in both *Negeri Salju* and *Daerah Salju*, within the logic of the conversation the translation in *Daerah Salju* is more accurate. This is because, since the station chief supervises Yōko’s brother and is responsible for him, it is expected that he knows what Yōko’s brother is doing. Furthermore, the word 「弟」 (*otouto*), which means ‘younger brother’, is only translated as *adik* (younger sibling) in both versions. As such, in both translations the sex of Yōko’s brother is indefinite.

Yōko makes a second request to the station chief.

11.a 「駅長さん、弟をよく見てやって、お願いします。」 (葉子)

悲しいほど美しい声であった。(島村の視点) (Kawabata 1965, p. 8)

「Ekichō san, otōto o yoku mite yatte, onegai desu」 (Yōko)

Kanashii hodo utsukushii koe de atta.

11.b “Mudah-mudahan terpelihara tingkah lakunya.” (Yōko) (“Hopefully his behavior is maintained.”)

Demikian merdu suara itu bagaikan merangsang kesedihan orang (Her voice was so melodious that it drew people’s sadness; Ma’ruf 1972, p. 12).

11 “Pak, saya betul-betul mohon agar Bapak membimbing adik saya baik-baik.” (Yōko) (“Sir, I truly beg you to guide my younger sibling well”)

Suaranya begitu indah hingga memilukan (Her voice was so beautiful that it was saddening, Rosidi 1985, p. 21).

In *Negeri Salju*, the sentence 「弟をよく見てやって、お願いします」 (*otōto o yoku mite yatte, onegai desu*) is translated *Mudah-mudahan terpelihara tingkah lakunya* (Hopefully his behavior is continued.). It thus transforms from a request for Yōko’s brother to be guided into an expectation that he follows proper etiquette. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, it is translated *Pak, saya betul-betul mohon agar Bapak membimbing adik saya baik-baik* (Sir, I truly beg you to guide my younger sibling well), and thus it remains a request made to the station chief (in accordance with the source text). From this description, it can be concluded that Yōko’s brother is still young and requires guidance.

Based on the analysis, characterization of Yōko’s brother is same relates to the sex, both of the translation are indefinite, but the description of the maturity is opposite.

④ Station Chief

The station chief is a man greeted by Yōko when she arrives in the snowy region together with the sick man. Yōko greets him as follows:

- 12.a 「駅長さんもう帰りですか？」(葉子)
 「私は怪我をして、医者に通ってるんだ。」(駅長)
 「まあ。いけませんわ。」(葉子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 7)
 「Ekichō san mō kaeri desuka?」(Yōko)
 「Watashi wa kega o shite, isha ni kayotterunda」(Ekicho)
 「Maa. Ikemasen wa.」(Yōko)
- 12.b “Tuan mau pulang sekarang, bukan?” (Sir, you are heading home now, are you not?) (Yōko)
 “Saya mengalami kecelakaan sedikit. Seharusnya saya pergi ke dokter.” (I had a small accident. I should go to a doctor”. (Station Chief)
 “Tuan harus lebih hati-hati.” (Sir, you should be more careful.) (Yōko) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 12)
- 12.c “Bapak sekarang mau pulang?” (Sir, are you heading home now?) (Yōko)
 “Aku terluka dan sekarang dirawat dokter.” (I’m hurt and am being treated by a doctor.) (Station Chief)
 “Oh! Kasihan.” (Oh, what a pity!) (Yōko) (Rosidi 1985, p. 21)

In all three versions, it is written that the station chief is injured. However, there is a difference between when the injury occurred. In *Negeri Salju*, the sentence 「私は怪我をして、医者に通ってるんだ。」(*Watashi wa kega o shite, isha ni kayotterunda*) is translated *Saya mengalami kecelakaan sedikit. Seharusnya saya pergi ke dokter* (I had a small accident. I should go to a doctor). As such, the Station chief is injured then and must go to a doctor to be examined. In *Daerah Salju*, this is translated *Aku terluka dan sekarang dirawat dokter* (I’m hurt and am being treated by a doctor). This injury occurred before and he had received treatment. Because he is receiving continuing treatment, he must return to the doctor’s office. This is more faithful to the sentence’s meaning in the source text.

⑤ Komako

Komako is a woman whom Shimamura seeks out during his return to the snowy region. She is a *geisha* who lives in the snowy region that serves as the novel’s setting. Komako is characterized as follows:

- 13.a 女はやはり生まれはこの雪国、東京でお酌をしているうちに受け出され、ゆくすえ日本舞の師匠として身を立たせてもらうつもりでいたところ、一年半ばかりで旦那が死んだ (Kawabata 1965, p. 14)
 Onna wa yahari umare wa kono yukiguni, Tōkyō de oshaku o shite iru uchi ni ukedasare, yukusue Nihonodori no shishō toshite mi o tatasete morau tsumori de ita tokoro, ichinen han bakari de danna ga shinda....
- 13.b Ia lahir di negeri salju ini, tetapi ia telah terikat kepada suatu kontrak sebagai geisha di Tokyo. Dewasa ini ia menemukan majikan yang membayarkan utang-utangnya, dan mengusulkan untuk mengangkatnya sebagai guru tari, tetapi malang satu setengah tahun kemudian lelaki itu meninggal (She was born in this land of snow, but she had been bound in a contract as a *geisha* in Tokyo. She had found a master who would pay off her debts and recommend that she be taken as a dance teacher, but unfortunately a year and a half later he died; Ma’ruf 1972, pp. 22–23).

13.c Ia dilahirkan di daerah salju ini dan ketika bekerja sebagai pelayan di Tokyo untuk melayani tamu-tamu minum sake ia menjadi piaraan seseorang dan mendapat kesempatan berlatih untuk menjadi guru tarian Jepang di kemudian hari, tetapi kira-kira satu setengah tahun kemudian yang memeliharanya meninggal (She was born in this snowy region and when she was working as a waitress in Tokyo serving sake to guests, she had been kept by someone who gave her the chance to train as a Japanese dance teacher, but about a year and a half later he died; Rosidi 1985, p. 36).

Komako is described as having lived in Tokyo and as having a patron (*danna*) to support her. *Danna* are the men who provided the necessary funding for a *maiko* (would-be *geisha*) during her training. A *danna* will remain a faithful guest of the *geisha*, although they will not be bound in marriage and the *geisha* may continue to serve other guests when she is not with her *danna*. In *Negeri Salju*, *danna* is translated *majikan yang membayarkan utang-utangnya* (a master who would pay off her debts). In *Daerah Salju*, *danna* is translated *seseorang* (someone). *Majikan*, according to the *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*, a standard monolingual Indonesian dictionary published by The National Language Development and Fostering Agency, means a person who organizes or provides work for others according to a contract, or a person who becomes the boss of (has authority over others); as such, the meaning of *danna* in the source text is not conveyed. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, *danna* is translated *seseorang* (someone), with the text *ia menjadi piaraan* (she had been kept); as such, it approaches the original meaning of the source text. Although women *menjadi piaraan* (being kept) is found in Indonesian culture, it is also used to refer to relations between a man and woman who are not bound by marriage. However, because the phrase 「受け出され」 (*ukedasare*) is not translated, the meaning of *danna* in the source text ('a man who must pay a certain amount of money to the owner of the 'shop' where Komako worked') is not conveyed in *Daerah Salju*.

Komako is then characterized as working as a *geisha*.

14.a 根は花柳界出の女らしいうちとけようを示して来た。男の気心を一通り知っているようでもあった (Kawabata 1965, p. 14).

Ne wa karyūkaide no onnarashii uchitokeyō o shimeshitekita. Otoko no kigokoro o hitotōri shitte iru yō de mo atta.

14.b Akhirnya menyingkapkan kepadanya bahwa ia sebenarnya seorang wanita sorgaloka belaka. Dan umumnya ia agaknya mengetahui apa yang kira-kira diketahui tentang pria (Finally it was known to her that she was nothing but a good-time girl. And generally she knew something of what was known about men (Ma'ruf 1972, p. 23).

14.c Ia mulai memperlihatkan keramahtamahan sebagai seorang wanita yang pernah bekerja di lingkungan *geisha*. Rupanya ia sudah dapat memahami bagaimana perasaan hati seorang laki-laki (She began to show her hospitality as a woman who had worked among *geisha*. It appeared that she could understand how a man felt in his heart; Rosidi 1985, p. 37).

In *Negeri Salju*, the phrase 「花柳界出の女らしい」 (*Ne wa karyūkaide no onnarashii*) is translated *wanita sorgaloka* (good-time girl), and Komako is thus characterized as an entertainer or prostitute. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, the phrase is translated *wanita yang pernah bekerja di lingkungan geisha*, giving a different impression. In Japanese, *geisha* has a different meaning than prostitute. *Geisha* are artists, and to become a *geisha*, women must spend much money to practice

dance and music. *Geisha* do not always provide sexual services to their guests, and such services are not compulsory. If they do provide sexual services, it is the *geisha* who decide to do so. Although *geisha* are not prostitutes, the translation *Negeri Salju* gives a different impression. In *Daerah Salju*, meanwhile, the implications of prostitution are avoided.

It is also shown that Komako comes from a port area:

15.a 「そう。ほんとうにそんなそうだわ。私の生まれは港なの。ここは温泉場でしょう。」と、女の思いがけなく素直な調子で、... (駒子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 16)

「Sō. Hontōni sonna sō da wa. Watashi no umare wa minato nano. Koko wa onsenba deshō.」 to, onna no omoi gakenaku sunao na chōshi de, ...

15.b “Benar. Begitulah caranya setiap orang yang datang ke mari. Ini mata air panas dan orang datang ke mari sehari dua, lalu pergi.” Caranya kentara terbuka –peralihannya hampir terlalu tiba-tiba (“Right. That’s how everyone who comes here does it. This is hot spring, and people come here for a day or two, then leave”. (Komako) Her manner was open—her transition almost too sudden; Ma’ruf 1972, p. 26).

15.c “Ya, begitu. Betul-betul semua begitu, ya? Saya dilahirkan di pelabuhan. Tapi di sini kan tempat pemandian mata air panas?” kata wanita itu dengan nada yang terus terang di luar dugaan (“Yes, like that. Everyone is like that, right? I was born at a port. But here there’s a hot spring, right?” (Komako) she said with an unexpectedly frank tone; Rosidi 1985, p. 40).

In *Negeri Salju*, the sentence 「私の生まれは港なの」 (*watashi no umare wa minato na no*), which states that Komako was born in a port region, is not translated. As such, this characterization is not conveyed by the translated text. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*—as with the source text—it is clearly stated that Komako was born near a port.

In the ‘first part’ of the novel, Komako is described as having lived with her dance and music teacher. Because *geishas* are expected to be skilled dancers and musicians, they usually live with their trainers. This novel is divided into two sections: first, Komako’s meeting with Shimamura before she becomes a geisha, and second, her meeting with Shimamura in the snowy region a year afterwards. In this analysis, the ‘first part’ of the novel refers to Komako’s first meeting with Shimamura.

16.a 師匠の家の娘だからであろうが、鑑札のない娘がたまに宴会などの手伝いに出ても、咎めたる芸者がいないであろう (Kawabata 1965, p. 18)。

Shishō no ie no musume dakara de arōga, kansatsu no nai musume ga tama ni enkai nado no tetsudai ni detemo, togametateru geisha ga nai de arō.

16.b Barangkali karena ia tinggal bersama guru musik, nampaknya tidak kesal akan kenyataan bahwa seorang wanita belum diperbolehkan jadi geisha yang sekali-kali membantu pada pesta-pesta (Perhaps because she lived with her music teacher, she did not appear upset that a woman was not yet allowed to become a geisha and occasionally help with the parties; Ma’ruf 1972, p. 30).

16.c Mungkin karena ia tinggal di rumah guru tari, maka walau tidak mempunyai surat izin dia kadang-kadang membantu perjamuan, tak seorang pun geisha yang menyatakan keberatan (Perhaps because she lived at the home of her dance teacher, even though she did not have a permit she sometimes helped with receptions, and

not one geisha expressed her objection; Rosidi 1985, pp. 46–47).

The word 「師匠」 (*shishō*) is translated with two different words. In *Negeri Salju*, it is translated *guru musik* (music teacher) and in *Daerah Salju* it is translated *guru tari* (dance teacher). Because geishas must be capable of dancing and playing music, both translations convey only half of the information in the source text, namely a person who teaches both dance and music. As such, Komako's characterization as a woman who studies both dance and music is conveyed only partially in both versions.

In terms of her personality, Komako is described as always keeping tidy, as below:

17.a 「君が家を持ったら、亭主は叱られ通しだね。」 (鳥村)

「なにも叱りゃしないじゃないの。洗濯するものまで、きちんと畳んでおくって。よく笑われるけれど、性分ね。」 (駒子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 36)

「Kimi ga ie o mottara, teishu wa shikaretooshidane.」 (Shimamura)

「Nani mo shikaryashinai janai no. Sentaku suru mono made, kichinto tatande okutte. Yoku warawareru keredo, shōbun ne」 (Komako)

17.b “Jika engkau punya suami, akan engkau habiskan segenap waktumu dengan marah-marah kepadanya?” (“If you had a husband, would you spend all your time getting angry at him?”) (Shimamura)

“Takkan begitu. Tetapi saya seharusnya tertawa bahkan untuk menggulung baju kotor saya. Saya tidak berdaya. Itulah sifat saya.” (Not like that. But I should laugh, even to roll up my dirty shirts. I’m powerless. That’s how I am (Komako); Ma’ruf 1972, p. 60)

17.c “Kalau engkau sudah berumahtangga pasti suamimu kau marahi terus.” (“If you started a family, surely you’d be angry at your husband all the time” (Shimamura))

“Saya ‘kan sama sekali tidak marah. Tapi saya memang ditertawakan orang karena pakaian yang hendak dicucipun sampai saya lipat dengan rapih. Tapi saya kira itu sudah menjadi tabiat saya.” (I’m not angry at all. But people do laugh at me, because I’ll even fold my dirty laundry neatly. But I think that’s just my character” (Komako); Rosidi 1985, p. 89).

In the source text, it is written 「洗濯するものまで、きちんと畳んでおくって」 (*Sentaku suru mono made, kichinto tatande okutte*), which means that Komako would even fold dirty laundry. However, in *Negeri Salju* this is translated *bahkan untuk menggulung baju kotor saya. Saya tidak berdaya* (even to roll up my dirty shirts. I’m powerless.), which does not convey the implication of the source text. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, this is translated *pakaian yang hendak dicucipun sampai saya lipat dengan rapih* (even fold my dirty laundry neatly), which is more faithful to the meaning of the source text. Generally, people only fold clothes when they are clean, but Komako is portrayed as a person who also neatly folds her dirty laundry. It can be understood that Komako is a neat person, a characterization which is more faithful to the meaning of the source text.

Meanwhile, in the source text, Komako is depicted as being capable of singing well in front of strangers but incapable of doing so in front of her friends and colleagues:

18.a 「それに馴染みの人の前では、声が出ないの。知らない人だと、大きな声で歌えるけれど。」(駒子)
(Kawabata 1965, p. 38)

「Sore ni najimi no hito no mae dewa, koe ga denai no. Shiranai hito da to, ōkii koe de utaeru keredo.」
(Komako)

18.b “Dan kemudian, suara saya keluar ketika saya bernyanyi untuk seseorang yang saya kenal baik. Nyanyian itu selalu nyaring dan unggul bagi orang-orang asing.” (“And then, my voice that comes out when I am singing for someone I know well. The singing is always shrill, and good for strangers” (Komako); Ma’ruf 1972, p. 63).

18.b “Apalagi di depan orang yang saya saya kenal, saya tidak bisa mengeluarkan suara. Tapi di depan orang yang tidak saya kenal, saya bisa menyanyi dengan suara keras” (“Especially in front of people I know, I cannot get my voice out. But in front of people I don’t know, I can sing with a loud voice” (Komako); Rosidi 1985, p. 94)

The phrase 「声が出ないの」(*koe ga denai no*) in *Negeri Salju* is translated *suara saya keluar* (my voice that comes out). It has the opposite meaning as the source text, as it depicts Komako as being able to sing in front of people she knows well. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* this is translated *saya tidak bisa mengeluarkan suara* (I cannot get my voice out), which is more faithful to the source text, in which Komako is incapable of singing well in front of people she knows well.

Based on the analysis, some of characterization of Komako in direct translation and indirect translation are opposite.

⑥ Masseur

The masseuse is a character who meets Shimamura in the snowy region. The conversation between Shimamura and the masseuse occurs when Shimamura asks her for a massage. During their conversation, Shimamura asks about the masseuse’s child.

19.a 「子供さんはもう大きいの？」(島村)

「はい。上の女は十三になります。」(マッサージの人) (Kawabata 1965, p. 32)

「Kodomo san mō ōkii no?」(Shimamura)

「Hai. Ue no onna wa 13 ni narimasu.」(Massaji no hito)

19.b “Anak-anak engkau sudah besar?” (“Are your children grown now?” (Shimamura))

“Gadis yang sulung duabelas tahun” (“My eldest daughter is twelve now” (masseuse)) (Ma’ruf 1972, p. 54).

19.c “Anaknya sudah besar?” (“Are your children grown?” (Shimamura))

“Ya, anak sulung sudah tigabelas tahun” (“Yes. My eldest child is thirteen now” (masseuse)) (Rosidi 1985, p. 81).

In all three versions, the text shows that the masseuse has a daughter. However, the identification of this daughter’s age differs. The phrase 「十三になります」(*juusan ni narimasu*) is translated in *Daerah Salju* as *tigabelas tahun* (thirteen). Meanwhile, in indirect translation, *Negeri Salju*, this phrase is translated *duabelas tahun* (twelve years). This difference

in ages occurs since the source text of the indirect translation, i.e. English version also translate the number as twelve as bellow:

“Your children are growing up?”

“The oldest girl is twelve,” (Seidensticker, 1996: 59).

Because the indirect translation is solely relies on English, the number was also translated as written in English version. This mistranslation can be relates to Japanese old system for counting age, *kazoedoshi* but I will analyze the translation of number in *Yukiguni*, including number related to age, number describing thickness and length, separately in another article.

⑥ Kikuyū

The character Kikuyū is a senior *geisha* in the snowy region, coworker of Komako, and a mainstay for the other *geishas* in her area. Shimamura met Kikuyū when he first arrived at the inn in the snowy region.

20.a ... 駒子と並んでいたの、島村も覚えのある芸者だった。ふっくりと押出しの大様な年増だった。
(島村の視点) (Kawabata 1965, p. 47)

... Komako to narande ita node, Shimamura mo oboe no aru geisha datta. Fukkuri to oshidashi no ōyō na toshima datta. (Shimamura no shiten)

20.b Ia adalah geisha yang seingat Shimamura telah dilihatnya bersama Koma. Nampaknya ia baik saja bertahun-tahun, tegap dan senang (She was the geisha that, as best as Shimamura could remember, he had seen with Koma. She appeared good over the years, firm and happy; Ma'ruf 1972, p. 81).

20.c Dia seorang geisha yang pernah dilihatnya karena ia nampak bersama Komako. Usianya sudah lanjut, montok, penyabar, dan peramah (She was a geisha whom he'd seen before, because she had been with Komako. She was of advanced age, shapely, patient, and friendly; Rosidi 1985, p. 119).

In *Negeri Salju* 「年増」 (*toshima*), which means a woman who has passed her youthful age, usually in her thirties or forties, was translated *baik saja bertahun-tahun* (good over the years), which does not reference her age. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* it was translated *usianya sudah lanjut* (she was of advanced age). Because elsewhere Kikuyu is said to be 33 years old, the phrase “of advanced age” is not consistent with her characterization.

Elsewhere, it is explained that Kiyuku is the geisha whom other women look to as a role model.

21.a 「菊勇ねえさんがいなくなると、私は寂しいんです。なんでもあの人を中心だったから。売れることも一番で六百本を欠かすことはないから、うちでも大事にされてたんだけども。」(駒子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 50)

「Kikuyū nēsan ga inakunaruto, watashi samishin desu. Nandemo anohito wa chuushin dattakara. Urerukoto mo ichiban de 600pon o kakasu koto wa nai kara, uchi de mo daiji ni saretan dakeredomo.」(Komako)

21.b “Ia menjadi pusat segala sesuatu. Dan ia memperoleh lebih banyak uang dari kami semua. Orangnya mengurus dengan baik baik” (“She was the center of everything. And she received more money than all of us. People

took good care of her” (Komako); Ma’ruf 1972, p. 85).

- 21.c “Dalam segala hal dialah yang menjadi pokok. Dan ia yang paling laku dan tidak pernah kurang dari enam ratus sehingga sangat dihargai di rumah induk semangnya” (“In everything, she was at the center. And she was the most salable and never earned less than six hundred, and so she was greatly respected at her mistress’s home” (Komako); Rosidi 1985, p. 126).

The source text and both translations identify Kikuyū as the main geisha in the region. The phrase 「売れることも一番で」 (*ureru koto mo ichiban de*) is translated in *Negeri Salju* as *ia memperoleh lebih banyak uang dari kami semua* (she received more money than all of us), with the phrase showing her income — 「六百本を欠かすことはないから」 (*600pon o kakasu koto wa nai kara*) — not being translated. In *Daerah Salju*, the sentence 「売れることも一番で六百本を欠かすことはないから」 is translated as *Dan ia yang paling laku dan tidak pernah kurang dari enam ratus* (she was the most salable and never earned less than six hundred), but it is difficult for the reader to understand because it is unclear what the phrase *kurang dari enam ratus* (less than six hundred) refers to. In the source text, this is given an asterisk, but without any explanation. As such, readers must discover how geisha were paid during this period.

According to Angelika Koch, the incense stick was called “flower”, and both prostitutes and geisha used it to measure the time. The period when a single incense burns is called a flower (一本 /*ippon*). The service charges of geisha and prostitutes is called *Hanadai*, for example one flower, two, three, etc and the charges is calculated based on number of the burned flowers (Koch, https://www.jpff.go.jp/j/project/intel/exchange/organize/ceeja/report/15/pdf/15_05.pdf,p.4). And according to <https://kotobank.jp/word/線香代>, the geisha services calculated by hours, and the time when one incense stick burned was used as the unit for measuring customer service time. However, the time per incense stick varies from 6 minutes to 1 hour, so the calculation is complicated.

Although I can not explained how much money is equal with *600 pon* but it can be understood that Kikuyū doing service as geisha in 600 incense stick burning time in one night.

Based on the analysis, description of the maturity of Kikuyū are differs, but although the nominal is not clear, the description of Kikuyū reputation as a popular *geisha* who earn much money are the same.

2. Plot

The plot of the three versions is the same, using a combination of chronological plot and reverse chronology. The main plot is as follows.

1. Shimamura travels to the snowy region for the second time → chronological plot
- ↓
2. Shimamura reminisces on his first trip to the snowy region → reverse chronology
- ↓
3. Shimamura travels to the snowy region for the third time → chronological plot

Although all three have the same plot, there are differences in each version’s plot division. The source text, from its

beginning to its end, is divided into eight plot divisions. However, nothing signals the shift between plot divisions except for an empty line. The format of the plot divisions in the translation texts are shown below.

Main Plot	Plot division	Plot division	Plot division
	Japanese text	<i>Daerah Salju</i>	<i>Negeri Salju</i>
1. Shimamura travels to the snowy region for the second time	1	1	1
2. Shimamura reminisces on his first trip to the snowy region	4	4	8
3. Shimamura travels to the snowy region for the third time	3	3	10
Total	8	8	19

In *Negeri Salju*, the separation between different plot divisions is signified with an asterisk, while in *Daerah Salju* the first word of each plot divisions is written entirely in capital letters. The English text as source text of *Negeri Salju* signals changes in the main story with “Part 1”, “Part 2”; this is rendered in *Negeri Salju* as *Bagian 1*, *Bagian 2* (“Part 1”, “Part 2”), while it is shown in *Daerah Salju* as *Bagian Pertama*, *Bagian Kedua*, etc. (The First Part, The Second Part). In *Daerah Salju*, the plot divisions is marked with the first word being written entirely in capital letters and an empty line being inserted. Meanwhile, plot divisions in *Negeri Salju* are divided without any clear basis, with some elements lost.

Examining the main plot of the story, it can be said that the three versions have the same main plot. However, considering the plot divisions, it can be concluded that *Negeri Salju* has 19 plot divisions. Meanwhile, *Daerah Salju* has 8 plot divisions and it can be concluded that plot divisions in *Daerah Salju* follows the same plot divisions as the source novel.

3. Setting

① Place Setting

The setting of this story is a snowy region, whose name is not mentioned at all. Most of the meetings between Shimamura and Komako occur in the room where Shimamura is staying.

22.a 「零時の上りだわ。」と、ちょうどその時間こえた汽笛に立ち上って、思い切り乱暴に紙障子とガラス戸をあけ、手摺りへ体を投げつけざまに腰かけた。(駒子)

冷気が部屋へいちどに流れ混んだ。汽車の響きは遠ざかるにつれて、夜風のように聞こえた。(地の文)

「おい、寒いじゃないか。馬鹿。」と島村も立ち上って行くと風はなかった。(島村) (Kawabata 1965, p. 26)

「Reiji no nobori dawa」 to, chōdo sono toki kikoeta kiteki ni tachiagatte, omoikiri ranbou ni kami shōji to garasudo o ake, tesuri e karada o nagetsukezama ni koshikaketa.(Komako)

Reiki ga heya e ichido ni nagare konda. Kisha no hibiki wa toozakaru ni tsurete, yokaze no yō ni kikoeta. (narrator)

「Oi, samui janaika. Baka.」 to Shimamura mo tachi agatte iku to kaze wa nakatta (Shimamura).

22.b “Tengah malam untuk Tokyo.” Wanita itu nampaknya akan menyingkapkan keragu-raguannya, dan ia berbicara seakan-akan hendak menyingkirkannya. Ketika bunyi kereta bersuit ia bangkit. Sambil membuka pintu kereta dan jendela di belakangnya keras-keras, ia duduk di bendul dengan tubuh bersandar pada pagar dari besi rel. Kereta bergerak lucut di kejauhan, gemanya lenyap dalam bunyi bagaikan angin malam. Udara sejuk menggenangi kamar itu. (“Midnight for Tokyo.” (Komako) The woman appeared to brush aside her doubt, and she spoke as if she were pushing it away. When the train sounded, she rose. While loudly opening the train door and window behind her, she sat on the sill, with her body leaning against the iron fence. The train disappeared in the distance, its echo dissolving into a sound like the night wind. Fresh air filled the room.)

“Engkau kehilangan akal?” Shimamura juga menjenguk ke jendela. Udara tenang tanpa ada gelagat angin (“Have you lost your mind?” (Shimamura) Shimamura also looked to the window. The air was calm, without any billowing wind; Ma’ruf 1972, pp. 42–43).

22.c “Itu datang kereta api tengah malam.” Sambil berdiri karena kebetulan mendengar suara peluit kereta api itu ia membuka shoji dan jendela kaca dengan amat kasar dan duduk di jendela dengan merebahkan tubuh pada langkan. (“Here comes the midnight train”. (Yōko) While standing, because she had been listening to the whistle of the train, she opened the *shoji* and the glass window roughly and sat on the window while spreading her body on the ledge).

Seketika itu juga masuklah udara dingin ke dalam kamar. Suara kereta api yang menjauh itu terdengar seperti angin malam saja. (At that moment, cold air entered the room. The sound of the increasingly distant train was like the night wind.)

“Hai, dingin, kau tolol, “ kata Shimamura seraya bangkit mendekati jendela tapi ternyata tidak ada angin (“Hey, it’s cold, you fool,” said Shimamura as he approached the window, but there was no wind.) (Rosidi 1985, p. 65).

In *Negeri Salju*, the phrase 「紙障子とガラス戸をあけ」 (*kamishōji to garasu to wo ake*), which means to open a wood-and-paper door and a glass window is translated *membuka pintu kereta dan jendela* (opened the train door and window). Because the word *kereta* (train) is in the translated text, the location of this scene shifts from a room to a train. However, the following phrase 「冷気が部屋へいちどに流れ混んだ」 (*Reiki ga heya e ichido ni nagare konda*) is translated *udara sejuk menggenangi kamar itu* (fresh air filled the room), the room setting is conveyed, and the sentence becomes illogical because it implies that the scene is set simultaneously in a room and on a train. In *Daerah Salju*, this is translated *membuka shoji dan jendela kaca* (she opened the shoji and the glass window), borrowing the term *shoji* from the source text. The borrowing word *shoji* is used without any explanation in the footnote and thus difficult to understand, but because the following sentence states *masuklah udara dingin ke dalam kamar* (cold air entered the room) so the readers can understand that the scene is set in a room.

Beside the difference of scene set in both translations, the phrase 「零時の上りだわ。」 (*Reiji no nobori dawa*) which means the midnight train for Tokyo, is also translated differently. In the *Negeri Salju*, it is translated into *tengah malam untuk Tokyo* (the midnight for Tokyo). Although there is no word “train” in the translation, the readers will understand that the conversation is about the train since it is described in the next sentence that they heard the sound of steam whistle. In

rail transport in Japan, especially Japan Railways (JR), the train bound for Tokyo is called *nobori* (上り) and the train departing from Tokyo is called *kudari* (下り). Thus, it can be concluded that the translation matches with original meaning in the source language. On the other hand, in the *Daerah Salju*, the phrase is translated into *itu datang kereta api tengah malam* (There comes midnight train) and thus the translation has opposite meaning with the source language.

In the following quotation, the description of the setting also differs between the source text and translation.

23.a 島村が近づくのを知ると、女は手摺に胸を突っ伏せた。(Kawabata 1965, p. 26)

Shimamura ga chikadzuku no o shiru to, onna wa tesuri ni mune o tsuppuseta.

23.b Ketika ia merasa Shimamura mendekat, wanita itu tersungkur dengan dadanya pada rel kereta (When she felt Shimamura approaching, the woman slouched with her chest on the train rails; Ma'ruf 1972, p. 43).

23.c Melihat Shimamura mendekat, wanita itu menekankan dadanya pada langkan jendela (Seeing Shimamura approach, the woman pressed her chest onto the window sill; Rosidi 1985, pp. 65–66).

In *Negeri Salju*, the word 「手摺」 (*tesuri*) is translated *rel kereta* (train rail), again giving the impression of being set on a train. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* it is translated *langkan jendela* (window sill), accurately reflecting the room setting of the source text.

The snowy region where the story is set is described as below:

24.a.日光のなかに立っていると、その氷の厚さが嘘のように思われて、島村はしばらく眺め続けた。(地の文、島村の視点) (Kawabata 1965, p. 29)

Nikkō no naka ni tatte iru to, sono koori no atsusa ga uso no yō ni omowarete, Shimamura wa shibaraku nagametsudzuketa.

24.b Shimamura, berdiri dalam cahaya matahari, susah untuk percaya bahwa es itu dapat demikian tebal. Dia berhenti sejenak untuk mengamati (Shimamura, standing in the sunlight, had difficulty believing that ice could be that thick. He stopped for a moment to observe it; Ma'ruf 1972, pp. 47–48).

24.c Kalau Shimamura berdiri di bawah sinar matahari, es itu terasa tidak begitu tebal dan untuk beberapa lama ia terus memandangnya (If Shimamura stood below the sunlight, the ice didn't feel that thick, and for a while he stood there gazing upon it; Rosidi 1985, p. 72).

In *Negeri Salju* the phrase 「その氷の厚さが嘘のように思われて」 (*sono koori no atsusa ga uso no yō ni omowarete*) is translated *susah untuk percaya bahwa es itu dapat demikian tebal* (had difficulty believing that ice could be that thick), showing that the region is very snowy. The phrase *susah untuk percaya* (had difficulty believing) emphasizes the thickness of the snow. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju*, this phrase is translated *terasa tidak begitu tebal* (didn't feel that thick). With the inclusion of the word *tidak* (no) in front of the word *tebal* (thick), the sentence instead suggests that there is not much snow in the region.

The following section shows that there is a field near Komako's home.

25.a 右手は雪をかぶった畑で、左に柿の木が隣家の壁沿いに立ち並んでいた。(地の文) (Kawabata

1965, p. 30)

Migite wa yuki o kabutta hatake de, hidari ni kaki no ki ga rinka no kabezoi ni tachinarande ita.

25.b Di sebelah kanan ada lapangan kecil dan di sebelah kiri pohon-pohon persimmon tumbuh sepanjang tembok yang membatasi daerah tetangga (To the right was a small field and to the left were persimmon trees growing along the wall separating her place with her neighbors'; Ma'ruf 1972, p. 50).

25.c Di sebelah kanannya ada ladang yang ditutupi salju dan di sebelah kiri berderet-deret pohon kesemak sepanjang dinding rumah sebelahnya (To the right was a field covered in snow and to the left were persimmon trees growing along the wall separating her house with her neighbors'; Rosidi 1985, p. 75).

In *Negeri Salju* 「畑」 (*hatake*) is translated *lapangan kecil* (small field), and as such the connotation of field for growing crops is not conveyed. Furthermore, the phrase 「雪にかぶった」 (*yuki ni kabutta*), which means covered in snow, is not translated, and thus the coldness of the setting is not conveyed. In *Daerah Salju*, the phrase 「雪をかぶった畑」 (*yuki ni kabutta hatake*) is translated *ladang yang ditutupi salju* (field covered in snow), and as such the source text's description of a cold agricultural field is accurately conveyed.

Descriptions of snow are common in the novel. The following quotation shows how much snow falls on the region.

26.a 「でも二日降れば、すぐ六尺は積もるわ。....」 (駒子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 43)

「Demo futsuka fureba, sugu rokushaku wa tsumoru wa.....」 (Komako)

26.b “Meski dua hari bersalju, namun akan kita alami enam kaki....” (“Even if it is snowing for two days, we’ll have six feet” (Komako); Ma'ruf 1972, p. 71).

26.c “Tapi kalau salju turun selama dua hari, akan tertimbun sampai kira-kira dua meter....” (“If snow falls for two days, about two meters come down” (Komako); Rosidi 1985, p. 106).

Although all three versions describe a large amount of snow falling, there are differences in their descriptions of the amount of snow. In *Negeri Salju*, 「六尺」 (*rokushaku*) is translated *enam kaki* (six feet), while in *Daerah Salju* it is translated *dua meter* (two meters). 尺 (*shaku*) means 30.3 cm, and thus 6 *shaku* is 181.8 cm. The unit *kaki* (foot) is 30.48 centimeters, meaning six feet is about 183 centimeters. In *Negeri Salju*, because the unit is translated *enam kaki* (six feet), its meaning is closer and the language more aesthetic than if 六尺 (*rokushaku*) were translated 181.8 cm. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* it is translated into *dua meter* (two meters) and not translated into 181.8 cm as long as in the source text. Although the thickness of the snow described about 20 cm much thicker than in the source text, but it is can be understood as a translation strategy for literary work to convey the literary sense of the word. I will analyze number related to Japanese old counting system in another article more comprehensively.

The novel also depicts this snow as being one of the region's main attractions and Shimamura's reason for visiting in the winter.

27.a 「雪見に來たいが正月は宿がこむだろうね。汽車は雪崩に埋れやしないか」 (Kawabata 1965, p. 43) (島村)

「Yukimi ni kitai ga shōgatsu wa yado ga komu darō ne. Kisha wa nadare ni umareya shinaika.」 (Shimamura)

- 27.b “Ingin saya melihat laut itu. Tetapi saya kira penginapan itu akan ramai. Dan mungkin ada bahaya tergelincir sepanjang jalan.” (“I want to see the sea. But I think the inn will be crowded. And maybe there will be the danger of slipping all along the road” (Shimamura), Ma’ruf 1972, pp. 71–72)
- 27.c “Saya mau datang ke sini untuk menikmati pemandangan salju pada tahun baru, tapi saya kira rumah-rumah penginapan penuh dengan tamu. Bukankah kereta api terbenam di dalam longsor salju?” (“I want to come here to enjoy the view of snow during the new year, but I think the inns will be crowded with guests. Can’t the trains be covered by avalanches?” (Shimamura); Rosidi 1985, p. 107).

In *Negeri Salju*, the phrase 「雪見に来たい」 (*yukimi ni kitai*), which means “want to see the snow”, is translated *ingin saya melihat laut itu* (I want to see the sea), and as such the translated text is completely unrelated to snow and unable to convey the snowy setting. In *Daerah Salju*, this is translated *Saya mau datang ke sini untuk menikmati pemandangan salju* (I want to come here to enjoy the view of snow), which accurately reflects the source text and leads readers to the understanding that Shimamura travelled to this area to see the snow.

Based on the analysis, some description of place setting are differs one another, such as description of the thickness of the snow and place where an episode is occurred.

② Time Setting

The novel’s time setting is when Shimamura makes his second trip to the snowy region at the end of the year.

- 28.a 「君はあの時、ああ言ってたけれども、あれはやっぱり嘘だよ。そうでなければ、誰が年の暮にこんな寒いところへくるものか」 (Kawabata 1965, p. 13) (島村)
 「Kimi wa ano toki, aa itteta keredomo, are wa yappari uso da yo. So denakereba, dare ga toshi no kure ni konna samui tokoro e kuru mono ka」 (Shimamura)
- 28.b “Engkau ingat apa yang engkau katakan ketika itu? Tetapi engkau keliru. Mengapa pula seseorang akan datang ke tempat semacam ini pada bulan Desember?” (“Do you remember what you said then? But you’re mistaken. Why would someone come to a place like this in December?” (Shimamura); Ma’ruf 1972, p. 21)
- 28.c “Walaupun dulu engkau berkata bahwa aku menertawakan engkau tapi itu tidak benar. Kalau benar, siapa yang akan datang ke tempat sedingin ini pada akhir tahun?” (“Though before you told me that I’d laugh at you, it isn’t true. If it were true, who would come to a place this cold at the end of the year?” (Shimamura); Rosidi 1985, p. 33).

All three versions describe Shimamura as coming to the snowy region at the end of the year. However, the diction used differs significantly. In *Negeri Salju*, the word 暮れ (*kure*), which means ‘end of the year’, is translated *Desember* (December), while in *Daerah Salju* it is translated *akhir tahun* (end of the year), which is accurate to the source text. This does not influence the reader’s understanding of the two translation texts.

Elsewhere, the snowy region is described as having *susuki* and *kaya* growing there.

- 29.a 「あんな長い、薄ですね」と島村は驚いて坂路を見た。背負って行く婆さんの身の丈の二倍もある。そして長い穂だ。(島村)
「はい。あれは萱でございますよ」(駒子) (Kawabata 1965, p. 48)
「Anna nagai, susuki desu ne」 to Shimamura wa odorite sakamichi wo mita. Seotte iku bāsan no mi no take no nibai mo aru. Soshite nagai ho da (Shimamura).
「Hai. Are wa kaya de gozaimasu yo.」 (Komako)
- 29.b “Lihat alangkah lamanya mereka” Shimamura melihat-lihat keheranan pada jalan curam itu ke bawah, yang ditempuh wanita-wanita tua dengan terhuyung-huyung dengan buntelan rumput musim gugur di punggungnya. Rumput itu kelihatan dua kali tinggi wanita itu, dan tali pengikatnya panjang dan kuat. (“See how long they are,” (Shimamura) Shimamura looked in shock at the steep road’s descent, which the old women were following slowly with their bundles of fall grass on their backs. The grass looked twice as tall as the women, and the rope binding it was long and strong.)
“Rumput kaya*”) (“Kaya grass” (Komako; Ma’ruf 1972, p. 81).
- 29.c “Itu yang panjang sekali, susuki bukan?” kata Shimamura melihat ke arah jalan menurun. *Susuki* itu dua kali tinggi si nenek yang menggendongnya. Tangkai bunganya juga panjang. (“The really long one, that’s *susuki*, right?” said Shimamura, astonished as he looked at the road down. The *susuki* was twice as tall as the old woman carrying it. Its flower stems were long too.)
“Bukan. Itu kaya” (“No. It’s *kaya*.” (Komako; Rosidi 1985, p. 120).

In *Negeri Salju*, 「あんな長い、薄ですね」 (*anna nagai, susuki desu ne*), which means ‘that tall grass is called *susuki*, right?’, is translated *alangkah lamanya mereka* (how long they are) and a description of the walking women seen from the room. Plants are frequently used in Japanese to signify a time setting in what is called *kigo* (季語). Mistakes in the translation of the plant’s name leads to this *kigo* not being conveyed. *Susuki* is a type of grass that is frequently seen during the autumn, towards the end of the year—appropriate for the time setting. *Kaya*, meanwhile, is a summer plant, and as such the use of the two plants in this conversation guides the reader’s understanding of the story’s time setting. In *Daerah Salju*, this sentence is translated *Itu yang panjang sekali, susuki bukan?* (‘The really long one, that’s *susuki*, right?’), in accordance with the source text. As such, the conversation between the characters is easier for the reader to understand. Likewise, the word *kaya*, can easily be understood as the name of a plant because of its context in the conversation.

It is later described how New Year’s is celebrated on 1 February in the snowy region.

- 30.a この村の正月は二月の一日だから、注連縄があるのだ。(地の文) (Kawabata 1965, p. 49)
Kono mura no shōgatsu wa 2 gatsu no tsuitachi dakara, shimenawa ga aru no da. (Jinobun)
- 30.b Karena di sini tahun baru dirayakan pada awal bulan Pebruari, tali jerami tradisional masih terentang di jalan-jalan pintas desa itu (Because the new year was celebrated at the beginning of February here, traditional straw ropes still hung on the village roads (narrator); Ma’ruf 1972, p. 83).
- 30.c Karena tahun baru di kampung itu dirayakan pada tanggal satu bulan Februari, *shimenawa* masih ada (Because the new year was celebrated in the village on the first of February, *shimenawa* were still around (narrator); Rosidi 1985, p. 123).

Although all three versions describe the new year as taking place in February, in *Negeri Salju* it is not explicitly translated as 1 February; instead, it is translated *awal Februari* (the beginning of February). As such, the reader may get the impression that the new year was celebrated not only on 1 February, but for the first ten days of February; in Indonesian, the phrase *awal bulan* does not refer solely to the first day of the month. In Indonesian, the phrases *awal bulan*, *tengah bulan*, and *akhir bulan* (beginning, middle, and end of the month), all of which are also found in Japanese (上旬 (joujun)、中旬 (chūjun)、下旬 (gejun)) but not used in the source text. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* this phrase is translated accurately as *tanggal satu bulan Februari* (the first of February).

Based on the analysis, the *kigo* (季語) in indirect translation is not translated and it can affect the reader's understanding about the time setting. And translation of date and month are also differs between indirect translation and direct translation. In direct translation, date and month are translated as the Japanese version but in indirect translation date and month are translated a little bit different.

IV. Conclusion and Recommendation

① Differences in Culture Influence the Translation Process

Based on the above analysis, it can be concluded that the translation process influences narrative facts in the novel (characters and characterization, setting, and plot). For instance, characters are described antonymously, or with different ages. Furthermore, the description of the setting (place and time) differs between the different translations and the source text. Likewise, although the main plot is the same, each version has a different division of sub-stories.

Likewise, differences in the material culture found in Japan but not Indonesia also influenced the translation process. For example, the word 「紙障子」 (*kamishouji*), which means a sliding door made of a wooden frame and paper screen, refers to an object not found in Indonesian culture. As such, differences are introduced to the description of the setting; a scene that should be set in a room is instead moved to a train, something that is illogical within the context of the scene.

② Benefits and Shortcomings of Direct and Indirect Translation in Regards to Narrative Elements

The analysis indicates that certain characters' characterization differs from the source text, as seen in (for example) their ages. Furthermore, as shown in data unit number 9, although all three versions of the text show Yōko asking the Station Chief to mentor her brother, her brother is described in a manner antonymous to the source text. In *Negeri Salju*, Yōko's brother is described as *bukan anak-anak lagi* (isn't a child anymore), which gives the impression that the character is an adult. Meanwhile, in *Daerah Salju* this is translated accurately as *masih anak-anak* (still a child). Furthermore, in the source text Komako is described as folding her dirty clothes. This is intended to characterize her as a very neat person, but this is translated antonymously in *Negeri Salju*, and thus Komako's neatness is not conveyed.

Negeri Salju was translated from an existing English-language edition, while *Daerah Salju* was translated directly from the original Japanese-language text. There are clear benefits and shortcomings to both translation approaches. In indirect translation, such as that practiced by *Negeri Salju*, because the translator depended entirely on the English-language edition, any mistakes made in the English-language edition were reproduced in the translation. Likewise, when translating the source text from Japanese to English, the original translator adapted the translation to the culture of his readers. As such, the Indonesian-language edition has had its Japanese cultural content adapted twice; first during the English-language translation

process and second during the Indonesian-language process. It is thus not surprising that the translated text deviates from the source text in places. However, such indirect translation is common for works of Japanese literature. Because Japanese uses kanji, katakana, and hiragana characters, none of which are easily understood by non-Japanese speaking translators—even those fluent in the language—translators use English-language editions as a shortcut to translating works of Japanese literature into Indonesian.

Meanwhile, *Daerah Salju* is a direct translation from Japanese. The analysis above indicates that such direct translation is better capable of conveying the same meaning as the source text, even though deviation occurs between the source text and the translated text (as seen in data units 16). As the translation of *Daerah Salju* involved a Japanese translator, Matsuoka Kunio, it can be concluded that direct translation should involve both a native speaker of the source language and a native speaker of the target language to ensure greater quality.

Elements of the story are an important in interpreting stories. Therefore, if the elements of the story are translated incorrectly, as described above, the interpretation of the novel will be affected. In conclusion, the most effective way in translating Japanese literary works into Indonesian is by collaboration between a Japanese who is fluent in Indonesian language and an Indonesian translator, while also taking into consideration the previous translation.

References:

Kawabata 1965

Kawabata Yasunari. "Yukiguni", *Nihon no Bungaku* (38): 7-88. Chūōkōronsha, 1965.

Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia online (<http://kbbi.web.id/>)

Ma'ruf 1972

Anas Ma'ruf, trans. *Negeri Salju*. Jakarta: Pustaka Jaya, 1972.

Rosidi 1985

Ajip Rosidi and Matsuoka, Kunio, trans. *Daerah Salju*. Jakarta: Pustaka Jaya, 1985.

Seidensticker 1996

Edward G Seidensticker, trans. *Snow Country*. New York: Vintage International, 1996.

Stanton 1965.

Robert Stanton. *An Introduction to Fiction*. Holt Rinehart and Winston, 1965.

Teeuw 1984

Andries Teeuw. *Sastra dan Ilmu Sastra: Pengantar Teori Sastra*. Jakarta: Dunia Pustaka Jaya, 1984.

https://www.jpff.go.jp/j/project/intel/exchange/organize/ceeja/report/15/pdf/15_05.pdf.p.4 accessed on October 10, 2019.

<https://kotobank.jp/word/線香代> accessed on October 10, 2019.